Case 3:10-cv-01447-ARC-PT Document 21-2 Filed 03/16/15 Page 1 of 4

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS, CLINTON COUNTY, PENNSYLVANIA CRIMINAL

| | COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA vs FABIAN D. SMART Defendant |)))) | NO. 175-2062 PCRA E 03 1 NO. 175-2062 | 8 FEB-22 P # 02 | MERRY L YARRISON OTHORDTARY & CLERK |
|---------------|--|------------------|--|-----------------|--|
| and a support | | • | | 2008 F | 5000 |

COMMONWEALTH'S RESPONSE TO SUPPLEMENTAL AMENDED PCRA PETITION

- 1. Denied. It is denied that trial counsel was ineffective for failing to file a motion to compel discovery of specific items of physical evidence for purposes of forensic testing and/or to have such evidence tested by an expert. It is averred to the contrary that counsel in this matter were extremely competent and pursued any and all avenues of defense on behalf of the Petitioner. Strict proof of the alleged ineffectiveness of counsel is demanded at the time of trial of this cause.
- 2. Denied. The Commonwealth is without sufficient evidence with which to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of this allegation and the same is denied. The Commonwealth is unable to proceed with discovery with respect to this allegation due to the unavailability of Attorney Travis. It is respectfully requested that this matter be continued for further hearing upon the availability of Attorney Travis, who is alleged to have been the attorney contacted by the juror in question.

3. Denied. It is denied that questions during voir dire were relating to racial bias were answered falsely by the perspective members of the panel and strict proof thereof is demanded at the time of the trial of this cause. It is averred to the contrary that trial counsel was extremely competent and thorough and the voir dire process of the jury

selection and followed accepted voir dire procedure.

4. Denied. It is denied that Petitioner's rights were violated in any manner by jurors falsely responding to questions during voir dire relating to racial bias. It is averred to the contrary that the voir dire process was properly conducted and in accordance with standard accepted practice under the circumstances. Strict proof thereof is demanded at the time of the trial of this cause.

5. Denied. It is denied that trial counsel was ineffective in any manner. It is averred to the contrary that the Defendant/Petitioner received superb representation by seasoned veteran defense attorneys without any financial limitations. It is averred to the contrary that the Defendant received every benefit of the doubt at the time of the trial, was provided with effective and competent co-counsel, and must be denied the right to a new trial.

Respectfully submitted,

By:

Michael F. Salisbury, District Attorney Counsel for the Commonwealth 322 East Water Street Lock Haven, PA 17745 ID #36957 (570) 893-4141

VERIFICATION

I, MICHAEL F. SALISBURY, ESQUIRE, CLINTON COUNTY DISTRICT

ATTORNEY, verify that the statements made in this Commonwealth's Response to Supplemental Amended PCRA Petition are true and correct. I understand that false statements made herein are made subject to the penalties of 18 Pa. C.S.P. Section 4904, relating to unsworn falsification to authorities.

Michael F. Salisbury, Esquire Clinton County District Attorne

Dated: 2-22-08

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF CLINTON COUNTY, PENNSYLVANIA CRIMINAL

| COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA |) | No. | 175-02 | | |
|----------------------------------|--------|------|--------|----------|--------|
| VS |)) | | | | |
| FABIAN DESMOND SMART, Defendant |) | | , | • | ÷ |
| | | | PA | 0.5 | 盖 |
| | | | 产 | ii O | YARRIS |
| CERTIFICAT | TE OF: | SFRV | | FEB 22 | 1040 |
| <u>OLKIII IOAI</u> | | | | 2008 FEB | HS C |

This <u>22nd</u> day of <u>FEBRUARY</u>, 2008, I, **MICHAEL F. SALISBURY**,

CLINTON COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY, do hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the Commonwealth's Response to Supplemental Amended PCRA Petition in the above-referenced matter was served upon David A. Strouse, Esquire, Attorney for Defendant above named, by depositing the same in his box designated for service in the Prothonotary's Office at the Clinton County Courthouse, Lock Haven, Pennsylvania, which service satisfies the requirements of Pa. R.A.P. 121:

By:

Michael F. Salisbury, Esquire Clinton County District Attorney 322 East Water Street

Lock Haven, PA 17745